Case 1:22-cv-00838-RJJ-PJG $\,$ ECF No. 85-4, PageID.1228 $\,$ Filed 04/09/25 $\,$ Page 1 $\,$ EXHIBIT $\,$

of 5

24

U.S. DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION

DONOUARION LEWIS: KE'AUJANAA SHEPHERD-FRIDAY; and K.B., by and through her parent

and next friend, H.B., Case No. 1:22-cv-00838-RJJ-PJG

> Plaintiffs, Hon. Robert J. Jonker Mag. Phillip J. Green

MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION, a governmental

Defendant.

The Deposition of JESSICA S. BRADY, Taken at 525 West Ottawa Street, Lansing, Michigan, Commencing at 10:15 a.m., Tuesday, July 16, 2024, Before Peggy S. Savage, CSR-4189, RPR.

U.S. Legal Support | www.uslegalsupport.com

Q. Okay. And SEA is a state educational agency, right? 2 Α. Correct. Q. A FAPE or an F-A-P-E is a free appropriate public 4 education, right? Correct. 5 6 Q. A CAP is a corrective action plan; is that right? 7 Correct. Α. The SPP is a state performance plan; is that right? 9 10 Q. And APR is an annual performance report; is that right? 11 12 13 ${\tt Q.}\,$ Okay. I'm going to have some more that we go over as time goes on. I just like to get some of that out of 14 15 the way so that everyone knows we're speaking the same language. Okay. 17 MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION DEPOSITION EXHIBIT 81 18 10:26 a.m. 19 20 21 Q. Now, if we'll turn to Exhibit 81 in the binder. Do you recognize what this document is? 22 23 Α. Yes.

U.S. Legal Support | www.uslegalsupport.com

Q. Is this a staff directory for the MDE OSE?

A. This is the organization chart.

Jessica S. Brady

		July 16, 2024
1		noncompliance, would also check to see if that were
2		widespread in the district; is that right?
3	A.	No.
4	Q.	Am I understanding you? No.
5		How am I misunderstanding you?
6	A.	It is widespread.
7	Q.	The example that we're talking about, B-12?
8	A.	No.
9	Q.	What is widespread?
10	A.	In a monitoring visit
11	Q.	Yes.
12	A.	when performance reporting pulls a sample of
13		records, if it is found in one, because it is a sample
14		of records, it is determined it is widespread, non
15		a noncompliance.
16	Q.	I think I understand. Okay. Okay. All right.
17		Monitoring in this way, you're pulling a
18		selection of student records, like you said, a sample,
19		right?
20	A.	Yes.
21	Q.	How do you determine the number of students for a
22		sample that you review?
23	Α.	There are business rules.
24	Q.	Okay. And those are formulas for determining the

U.S. Legal Support | www.uslegalsupport.com

25

sample size?

		Jessica S. Brady July 16, 2024
1	А.	Yes.
2	0.	Do those how do those business rules work? Are
	ν.	
3		is it related to the number of students eligible for
4		special education in a district, in an ISD?
5	A.	The business rules have to do with error, percent of
6		time that we would perceive error.
7	Q.	Could you elaborate, please?
8	A.	So if there was if we pulled eight records or
9		20 records, what is the probability that there would
10		be an error if we didn't if we pulled less or more
11		if because it's a random selection.
12	Q.	And that chance of error, is that determined based on
13		experience monitoring for that issue?
14	A.	Statistical.
15	Q.	Statistical experience?
16	A.	I can't exactly tell you. I had an ed research
17		consultant do it.
18	Q.	If you need a degree in statistics to understand it,
19		I we'll struggle. I appreciate it.
20		Is there any other information concerning
21		these business rules that is online or elsewhere?
22	A.	Business rules are not online.
23	Q.	Okay. Are there internal guidance documents that MDE
24		has concerning business rules?
25	Α.	Yes.

Case 1:22-cv-00838-RJJ-PJG ECF No. 85₁4, PageID.1230 Filed 04/09/25 Page 3

Jessica S. Brady July 16, 2024

1 Q. Would you be able to provide them? 2 A. I could get them. 3 Q. Okay. Okay. And so if you find noncompliance within a sample, because you have these business rules, and 4 - 5 you know that there is an issue that's widespread; is 6 that right? 7 Α. Correct.

Q. Okay. And so at the point when you find the

9 noncompliance, do you then request additional records

to see where else the issue may be?

11 A. No.

8

13

23

25

25 A.

Correct.

12 Q. Okay. In the example we were talking about with B-12,

there was one student that you found and then four

14 similarly situated students.

In that hypothetical, were you thinking
that in that sample that you collected, there were

five issues in the sample?

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. So you don't take another sample when you find

20 noncompliance; is that right?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. Okay. All right. And so we were talking about

verification of student-level correction of

24 noncompliance, and so that's what would be required at

the student level, right?

U.S. Legal Support | www.uslegalsupport.com

8

Jessica S. Brady July 16, 2024

1 A. Correct. 2 0. Now, backing up, there was also verification of 3 district-level noncompliance. Can you please describe 4 Yes. So after the student level has been corrected, 5 Α. 6 we do a system-level verification where the Office of Special Education pulls another sample of students to 7 ensure that at the system level that has been 8 9 corrected. 10 O. I see. 11 So that gets to that -- your questions before. 12 Q. Yes. Okay. That makes sense. 13 Now, the systems level, that occurs after the student-level correction is already verified; is 14 15 that right? 16 Α. Yes. 17 Okay. And at the systems level, another sample is 18 taken, right? 19 Α. Correct. 20 Q. And that sample also is taken according to similar 21 business rules; is that right? 22 A. Correct. Okay. To ensure that the sample taken would be 23 0. 24 representative and, if found, correction, then -- I'm 25 sorry, noncompliance, it would be understood it would

U.S. Legal Support | www.uslegalsupport.com

0.4

Jessica S. Brady July 16, 2024

1		be widespread? I can rephrase that. I apologize.
2		The business rules are similar for the
3		sample of the systems, right?
4	Α.	Correct.
5	Q.	So if you identified noncompliance in that sample, you
6		would know the issue was not corrected, right?
7	A.	Correct.
8		MR. SICKON: I'd like to take one more
9		five-minute break, if that's all right with everybody.
10		(Off the record at 12:20 p.m.)
11		(Back on the record at 12:25 p.m.)
12	BY M	MR. SICKON:
13	Q.	All right. Ms. Brady, we were just talking about
14		student-level and system-level verification for
15		noncompliance found during monitoring. We had
16		discussed how, at nine months, an ISD or member
17		district ought to prompt ISD to start performing the
18		verification process, right?
19	Α.	Yes.
20	Q.	Okay. That leaves three months for OSE to verify; is
21		that right?
22	A.	Kind of.
23	Q.	The issue must be corrected with one within one
24		year of identification, right?

		Jessica S. Brady July 16, 2024
1		Child Find, right?
2	A.	Yes.
3	Q.	Now, we talked a little bit about how CAPs operate.
4		How would this CAP work? How would it what do you
5		imagine this CAP would require KPS to do?
6	A.	A full corrective action plan.
7	Q.	How do you imagine they would satisfy that corrective
8		action plan, if you know?
9	A.	I whatever they would have to do a develop a
10		RAP team and then develop activities to fill those
11		activities and then the Office of Special Education
12		would have to verify correction of verify
13		correction of noncompliance.
14	Q.	And would that include the same sampling review of
15		educational files that we talked about at the student
16		level and system level?
17	Α.	Yes.
18	Q.	Okay. When it comes to those reviews, that
19		verification of the student and system level, who
20		performs those reviews?
21	A.	Both the ISD and the Office of Special Ed.
22	Q.	So in this instance, the member district, KPS, would
23		provide the educational records for, let's say, the
24		student level to the ISD to review; is that right?
25	A.	Yes.

of 5

		July 16, 2024
1	Q.	And then the ISD would then provide it to OSE; is that
2		right?
3	A.	Yes.
4	Q.	And the same would be true for the systemwide
5		verification, right?
6	A.	Yes.
7	Q.	Okay. Would there be a statewide monitor assigned to
8		do the review for OSE at that student and system
9		level?
10	A.	Potentially.
11	Q.	Who else could do that work at performance review
12		I'm sorry, performance reporting?
13	A.	Any of the monitoring and technical assistance
14		consultants.
15	Q.	Or the statewide monitors that are contracted, right?
16	A.	Correct.
17	Q.	Okay. All right. Would program accountability have
18		any involvement in either issuing or verifying this
19		CAP?
20	A.	No.
21	Q.	Okay. On the next page, on 3, at the top there it
22		shows that KPS was issued an UNC CAP concerning 4B; is
23		that right?

U.S. Legal Support | www.uslegalsupport.com

That's suspension and expulsion by race or ethnicity,

24 Α.

25

Q.

Yes.

		July 16, 2024
1		help with state complaint, district-level CAPs?
2	A.	It's hard to quantify.
3	Q.	If you had to guess.
4	A.	I I can't guess.
5	Q.	Who, at performance reporting, would help with the
6		verification of a correction of noncompliance that's
7		the result of a state complaint, district-level CAP?
8	A.	Statewide monitors.
9	Q.	Okay. And those are the contract employees?
10	A.	Yes.
11	Q.	Okay. And so those statewide monitors can receive
12		work from program accountability as well as
13		performance reporting; is that right?
14	A.	Yes.
15	Q.	Can they receive that work independent of performance
16		reporting knowing about it?
17	A.	It's a weird question.
18	Q.	I'm just wondering if they can receive assignments
19		from program accountability that performance reporting
20		wouldn't know about?
21	A.	It's assigned by Catamaran.
22	Q.	When you say Catamaran assigns work to statewide
23		monitors, is there a formula or an algorithm in
24		Catamaran that's choosing who works on CAPs?
25	A.	So for performance reporting, we say you're going
		U.S. Legal Support www.uslegalsupport.com 96

Jessica S. Brady July 16, 2024

1 to -- this person is going to work on these member 2 districts within this ISD for complaints. If we are 3 going to work on district-level complaints, I say for 4 the month of January, it will be Christy. For the month of February, it will be this person. That's why 5 I can't quantify how many were released, right. So it 6 7 could be 15 were released in January. One was 8 released in February. But Christy had January. Kelley had February. I don't know whoever else. I 9 10 11 Q. So on a monthly basis, you assign people to help with 12 those state complaint, district-level CAPs? 13 A. Correct. Q. And that rotation among your staff is geographical as 15 well? 16 A. No. 17 Q. No. It's just based on the assignment, the work type? 18 A. For complaint CAPs, it's based on a month. 19 Q. Okay. A. For monitoring CAPs, it's based geographical. 20 Q. Okay. Are the geographical assignments permanent? 21 22 A. It doesn't have to be, no. 23 Q. No. Okay. 24 Would you know -- and this is for -- is this for statewide monitors, or is it for also the 25

U.S. Legal Support | www.uslegalsupport.com

		Jessica S. Brady July 16, 2024
1		other monitoring group that you supervise?
2	А.	Which one?
3	0.	The monitoring technical assistance group.
4	Α.	The monitoring CAPs are geographical for the
5		monitoring and technical assistance team and the
6		statewide monitors.
7	0.	Okay. Would you happen to know who is assigned to
8	v.	monitoring CAPs for KRESA, Kalamazoo Regional
9		Educational Service Agency?
10	Α.	I do not know.
11	0.	Okay. Do you know who would be assigned to Kalamazoo
12	Q.	Public Schools?
13	Α.	The same person that assigned the KRESA.
14	0.	Okav. All right. But for the other CAPs, the program
15	~.	accountability CAPs, the state complaint CAPs, those
16		are assigned by month; is that right?
17		
Τ,	70	
1.8	A.	Correct.
18	A. Q.	Correct. And that involves the same group, the monitoring and
19	Q.	Correct. And that involves the same group, the monitoring and technical assistance folks and the statewide monitors?
19 20	Q.	Correct. And that involves the same group, the monitoring and technical assistance folks and the statewide monitors? No.
19 20 21	Q. A. Q.	Correct. And that involves the same group, the monitoring and technical assistance folks and the statewide monitors? No. Who is in that group?
19 20 21 22	Q. A. Q. A.	Correct. And that involves the same group, the monitoring and technical assistance folks and the statewide monitors? No. Who is in that group? The statewide monitors for complaint CAPs.
19 20 21 22 23	Q. A. Q.	Correct. And that involves the same group, the monitoring and technical assistance folks and the statewide monitors? No. Who is in that group? The statewide monitors for complaint CAPs. I see. So it doesn't include the monitoring and
19 20 21 22 23 24	Q. A. Q. A. Q.	Correct. And that involves the same group, the monitoring and technical assistance folks and the statewide monitors? No. Who is in that group? The statewide monitors for complaint CAPs. I see. So it doesn't include the monitoring and technical assistance group?
19 20 21 22 23	Q. A. Q. A.	Correct. And that involves the same group, the monitoring and technical assistance folks and the statewide monitors? No. Who is in that group? The statewide monitors for complaint CAPs. I see. So it doesn't include the monitoring and

that based on the analysis of such data and 1 refer students for evaluation who might have 1 disabilities? 2 information, states may determine whether targeted 2 MS. HENDLEY: Objection, form. 3 monitoring -- and then it starts a parenthetical, 3 4 4 i.e., a monitoring activity that occurs outside of the You can answer, if you can. THE WITNESS: If a concerned citizen state's normal cycle to address emerging or new 5 5 notifies us that their child has not been evaluated or issues, and typically is limited in scope, end 6 6 7 someone in the community has not been evaluated, and 7 parenthetical, is appropriate to ensure that the they requested an evaluation, we certainly monitor. relevant IDEA requirements are properly implemented. 8 9 BY MR. SICKON: 9 Is that right? Yes. That's what it says. 1.0 Ο. Okay. When you say that you monitor, how do you 10 Α. capture the data of that concern? Okay. Does performance reporting perform targeted 11 11 Q. 12 It is either in a state complaint or addressed at the 12 monitoring in the same sense that it is used in this 13 13 sentence? Α. No. 14 Ο. Would that be with the assistance of an ISD compliance 14 15 monitor? 15 Q. Does any other office in OSE -- or any other unit -- I 16 An ISD representative. apologize -- in OSE perform targeted monitoring like 17 Okay. Are there any other ways through MSDS -- it 17 it's used in that sentence? 18 Α. 18 could be, you know, the Wayne State surveys, any other information -- that you receive other than from a Any other office within MDE? 19 19 Q. Not that I'm aware of. 20 concerned citizen about students who may need special 20 Α. 21 education evaluations who don't get referred for it? 21 MR. SICKON: Okay. All right. It's been Besides a state complaint? 22 2.2 about an hour since we started up again. I'd just like to take another five-minute break, if that's all 23 Ο. Correct. 23 24 Α. I don't think so. 24 right with everyone. MS. HENDLEY: Yes. Thank you. Q. Okay. Now, the next sentence in that paragraph states

U.S. Legal Support | www.uslegalsupport.com

U.S. Legal Support | www.uslegalsupport.com